FREDERICK BURWICK

Blake's *Laocoön* and *Job*: or, On the Boundaries of Painting and Poetry

The interaction between the verbal and visual media in Blake's illuminated works is mercurial and, as most critics have confessed, often baffling. While they sometimes illustrate or interpret, the illuminations often augment and enhance the text. Frequently, Blake problematizes the cross-references between his two sign systems, so that the connections between signifier and signified are disrupted by irony and paradox. In *America*, for example, a scene of peaceful tranquillity (plate 7) illustrates the indictment of revolutionary atrocities:

> Art thou not Orc, who serpent form'd Stands at the Gate of Enitharmon to devour her children; Blasphemous Demon, Antichrist, hater of Dignities: Lover of wild rebellion, and transgressor of Gods Law; Why dost thou come to Angels eyes in this terrific form?(*America* 7)¹

Because the "Angels eyes" see something radically different from what the scene depicts, Blake forces us to doubt the accusations of Albion's Angel.

The very fact that Blake has two media at his disposal enables him to shift inobtrusively from an open to a closed system of referentiality. According to the distinction derived from Plato's *Cratylos*,² the visual sign is "natural" because it attempts to replicate the objects of external nature while the verbal sign is "artificial" because it refers only through an arbitrary system of language. In either case, an assumed referent for the sign is supposed to exist in the external world. As Hegel was to point out, however, signs may be only self-referential.³ To the extent that discourse elaborates a symbolism, its

Burwick, Frederick. "Blake's *Laocoon* and *Job*: or, On the Boundaries of Painting and Poetry."

The Romantic Imagination: Literature and Art in England and Germany.

Ed, Burwick, Frederick and Jurgen Klein.

Rodopi, Amsterdam and Atlanta, GA, 1996.

Pages: 125-155

Figures (In order of reference): 26, 17, 20, 68, 11, 14, 12, 13, 16, 4, 25, 18, 5, 7, 9, 15, 16, 19, 21, 22, 56, 23. Available in the Figures PDF

¹ The Complete Poetry and Prose of William Blake, ed. David V. Erdman, Commentary by

Harold Bloom (Berkeley and Los Angeles: U. of California P, 1982), 53-4. Quotations from

this edition are documented parenthetically in the text with abbreviated title and plate number.

² Plato: The Collected Dialogues, eds. Edith Hamilton and Huntington Cairns (Princeton: Princeton UP, 1963), 421-74.

³ G.W.F. Hegel: Enzyklopädie der philosophischen Wissenschaften, §§457-8; Vorlesungen über die Ästhetik. In Werke, 20 vols., eds. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Markus Michel (Frankfurt/M.: Suhrkamp, 1970), X, 269-70; XIII, 394-6.

referentiality becomes self-contained. Although Blake may allow his visual signs to refer only to his verbal signs, or *vice versa*, he is wary of the entrapment of self-referentiality.

In The Marriage of Heaven and Hell, Blake's first "Memorable Fancy" describes how the engraved book encloses as well as opens into a visionary process:

When I came home; on the abyss of the five senses, where a flat sided steep frowns over the present world. I saw a mighty Devil folded in black clouds, hovering on the sides of the rock, with corroding fires he wrote the following sentence now perceived by the minds of men, & read by them on earth.

How do you know but ev'ry Bird that cuts the airy way,

Is an immense world of delight, clos'd by your senses five? (MHH, 6-7)

The experience is engraved on the copper plate, "a flat sided steep", and etched with acid, "corroding fires". The message, thus recorded by "a mighty Devil", is held in the book, to be "perceived by the minds of men, & read by them on earth". The message itself affirms that the inscribed line may open up "an immense world of delight". Blake argues in *The Marriage of Heaven* and Hell that we must put aside the false codes which denounce creative energy as diabolical and learn to "read the Bible [...] in its infernal and diabolical sense".

The opposite doctrine is preached by Urizen, the staunch upholder of the false codes, whose book is not the book of energy but the book of law. *The Book of Urizen*, Blake's most bookish book, thematizes the entrapment. The title-page shows Urizen seated on a book, before a book, and between books. Although his eyes are closed, he seems to absorb the text through the braille-touch of his toes. To the rear, Mosaic tablets block the dark abyss. With the quill in his left hand, he writes one book; with the burin in his right hand, he engraves another. The double columns and chapter divisions visually emphasize the bookishness of the text. The text declares Urizen's confinement in the book.

Here alone I in books formd of metals Have written the secrets of wisdom. (Urizen, 5)

Confined within a book, he claims to write a book. In "the Book of brass" Urizen inscribes the "one Law" which, as Blake declared at the end of *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell*, is oppression.

> One command, one joy, one desire, One curse, one weight, one measure One King, one God, one Law (*Urizen*, 4)

Even as he displays his book "On the rock of eternity", Urizen remains entrapped by its dictates.

In his illustrations to The Book of Job,⁴ Blake again addresses the potential tyranny of the book. While the musical instruments hang idly on the tree (Job, 1), Job has his family dutifully attend the written word. His worship of the book is stressed in the caption: "Thus did Job continually." But is it right to worship the book? On the sacrificial pyre is inscribed the caveat: "The Letter Killeth / The Spirit giveth Life." Because this work comes late in Blake's career, and because it illustrates not his own work but a biblical text, the illustrations to The Book of Job have not been examined adequately in relation to Blake's illuminated prophecies. Although his engravings for The Book of Job, commissioned by John Linnell in 1823, are dated 1825, the engraved series are based on the twenty-one water colors executed for Thomas Butts between 1805 and 1806. These were copied for Linnell in 1821.⁵ Blake's prophecies, it should be remembered, are saturated with his reading of the Hebrew Bible. In addition to his frequent recourse to the prophets Isaiah, Ezekiel, and Jeremiah, Blake also adapted from the trial of Job in narrating the self-righteous protests of Urizen and Tharmas in The Four Zoas and the agony of the fallen Albion in Jerusalem.6 He had first depicted "The Complaint of Job", along with "The Death of Ezekiel's Wife", in the pen and wash drawings of 1785 which were then engraved in the companion set of "Job" (1793) and "Ezekiel" (1794). The tempera of "Job and his Daughters" (1799-1800) and the watercolor of "Job confessing his Presumption to God who answers from the Whirlwind" (c. 1800-5) established the dramatic situation repeated in the series of twenty-one illustrations.

Burwick: Blake's Laocoon and Job

⁴ William Blake's Illustrations of the Book of Job, with Introduction and Commentary by S. Foster Damon (Providence: Brown UP, 1966); Andrew Wright: Blake's Job: A Commentary (Oxford: Clarendon, 1972); Jenijoy La Belle: "Words Graven with an Iron Pen: The Marginal Texts in Blake's Job". In: The Visionary Hand: Essays for the Study of William Blake's Art and Aesthetics, ed. Robert N. Essick (Los Angeles: Hennessey & Ingalls, 1973), 527-50; Illustrations of the Book of Job Commentary by Bo Lindberg (London: The William Blake Trust, 1987).

 ⁵ Martin Butlin: The Paintings and Drawings of William Blake 2 vols. Plates and Text (New Haven and London: Yale UP, 1981), Text, 409-35.

 ⁶ Northrop Frye: "Blake's Reading of the Book of Job." In: William Blake: Essays for S. Foster Damon, ed. Alvin H. Rosenfeld (Providence: Brown UP, 1969), 221-34. See also: Harold Bloom: Blake's Apocalypse (Garden City: Doubleday, 1963), 362-4; 372-3; 388. Although he excludes The Four Zoas and Jerusalem from the scope of his investigation, allusions to Job in Europe, Asia, and The Book of Ahania are discussed in Leslie Tannenbaum: Biblical Tradition in Blake's Early Prophecies (Princeton: Princeton UP, 1982), 164; 193; 243.

The illustrations to The *Book of Job* were developed, then, not subsequent to, but as an intimate part of that visual and verbal adaptation of the Bible which informs Blake's major prophecies. Precisely because it emerges from the same appropriation of biblical matter, yet further elaborates the doctrine of the "fallen" word redeemed by the "spiritual" image, the engraved sequence of 1825 provides a unique tool for understanding the relationship between Blake's visual and verbal modes throughout his illuminated works. The "natural" sign must release the "artificial" sign from its Urizenic entrapment.

The most unique and distinguishing feature of Blake's illustrations to *The Book of Job*, considered in comparison to the whole canon of his engraved and illuminated works, is his use of framing. From the *Songs of Innocence and Experience* through *Milton* and *Jerusalem*, Blake has either made the relationship of his visual and verbal message immediate, with no dividing frame (as in his title-pages), or he has mediated his verbal message through a visual frame, whether informally interpretive (as in "Infant Joy", *SofI*, or "Sick Rose", *SofE*), or formally structured and stylized ("Introduction", *SofI*, or *Milton*, 33). In illustrating *The Book of Job*, however, Blake does just the opposite: he gives us in sequence a visual narrative mediated through a frame containing the verbal text. Another exception to his consistent practice of embracing the text within the visual medium are the plates to the *Gates of Paradise*, which have, of course, no verbal narrative, but only captions.

A more notable exception is Blake's abundantly annotated Laocoön [figure 26], which mediates the visual image through a welter of polemical graffiti. Blake's turn from his otherwise pervasive practice of mediated representation (verbal within visual) or immediate representation (verbal-visual interaction with no frame) reveals a conflict between word and image which Blake later thematizes in the frames which interpret and mediate the narrative of Job. Although without narrative sequence, the text to Laocoön is not lacking in polemic coherence. Indeed, Blake uses the Laocoön, much as Lessing used it in Laokoon: oder, über die Grenzen der Malerei und Poesie (Laocoön: or, on the boundaries of painting and poetry, 1766), to argue the nature and limits of verbal and visual signs.

Blake's conception of language, as Robert Essick has demonstrated, is essentially Adamic. Throughout his prophetic works, Blake asserts a confidence that signs, though fallen from their primal intimacy with things signified, can regain their original motivation through the energy of the imagination.⁷ In order to recreate the telic power of the sign, the mind must not balk at the material, empirical limits of perceived nature. In *The Four Zoas* (4:271-6; 7:383-4) and *Jerusalem* (42:29-35), he tells how the Saviour reached into Albion's bosom, found the limits of opacity and contraction, and named them Adam and Satan. But he also tells how to turn from opacity and contraction to translucence and expansion which have no limits. This is the argument which Blake engages in his *Laocoön*. In contrast to Lessing's *Laokoon*, Blake is concerned with liberating rather than fortifying the boundaries between visual and verbal, natural and artificial signs.

Emphasizing the difference in media, Lessing claims that the visual arts are spatial, the verbal arts are temporal. Although the function of all art is to create illusion, the artist must recognize that inherent limits restrict the extent to which the given space of a painting or statue may engage an illusion of temporal flux. So, too, the poet must recognize that the static nature of spatial description is at odds with the temporal flow of language. While Virgil could give temporal action to his narrative account, the marble statue of Laocoön and his two sons, Lessing argues, strains against the boundaries of the sculptural medium in its implication of dramatic struggle.⁸

For Blake, the Laocoön group represents the very curse of limitation. The statue, according to his caption, depicts the fallen Jehovah of the material world and "his two Sons Satan & Adam as they were copied from the Cherubim of Solomons Temple by three Rhodians & applied to Natural Fact or History of Ilium".⁹ That is, the original freedom of Hebraic vision had been confined by mimetic naturalism. The three Rhodian sculptors were guilty, in Blake's appraisal, of suppressing imagination in behalf of material nature, thus propagating the classical ideals of wealth and war. Bound by the limits of contraction, "Adam is only The Natural Man & not the Soul or Imagination." Over the head of the other serpent-bound son Blake has written: "Satans Wife The Goddess Nature is War & Misery & Heroism a Miser."

The polemical engraving of Laocoon belongs to the same period as The Ghost of Abel, On Homers Poetry and On Virgil (1822).¹⁰ What these works

9 Pliny: Naturalis Historia 36, 37. Agesander, Polydorus, and Athenodorus (Rhodian sculptors of the Pergamine School) completed the Laocoön group during the second half of the first century. Although Blake may not have meant that the Laocoön story (Aeneid, 2:40-56;

- 199-231) was directly indebted to Hebraic sources, modern scholarship has documented evidence in the Aeneid of Virgil's awareness of "the Messianic writings of the Hebrews"; see: Gilbert Highet: The Classical Tradition: Greek and Roman Influences on Western Literature (London: Oxford UP, 1949; rpt. 1957), 72-4
- 10 David Bindman dates the Laocoön "ca. 1822?" "This remarkable print has been dated by Keynes ca. 1818, but its close connection in thought with one of the 'Sybilline Leaves', On

128

⁷ Robert N. Essick: William Blake and the Language of Adam (Oxford: Clarendon, 1989), 14-5.

⁸ Gotthold Ephraim Lessing: Laokoon: oder, über die Grenzen der Malerie und Poesie. In: Werke 8 vols., eds. Herbert G. Göpfert et al. (Munich: Carl Hanser, 1974), VI, 7-187.

Burwick: Blake's Laocoön and Job

Part II - The Sister Arts

have in common is Blake's defense of Hebraic vision against the prevailing tyranny of Graeco-Roman classicism and materialist science. In order to be objective, science must prescind its objects from all subjective human interaction. As he states in *On Virgil*, "Rome & Greece swept Art into their maw & destroyd it." Instead of the "Living Form" engendered in the imagination, they produced only a "Mathematic Form" fostered by "the Reasoning Memory". In *On Homers Poetry*, he blames Graeco-Roman classicism for promulgating a false doctrine of unity. True unity is created only in "Living Form"; it is not the construct of "Mathematic Form". Thus, "when a Work has Unity it is as much in a Part as in the Whole. The Torso [the Farnese Torso] is as much a Unity as the Laocoon."

The argument is continued in his *Laocoön* commentary: "Science is the Tree of Death Art is the Tree of Life." With the suppression of the creative imagination, material greed prevailed with dire consequences: "Art Degraded Imagination Denied War Governed the Nations." In the script arching over the head of Laocoön, Blake writes:

Hebrew Art is called Sin by Deist Science. All that we See is Vision from Generated Organs gone as soon as come Permanent in the Imagination; considered as Nothing by the Natural Man (*Laocoön*)

The task of the visionary poet is to throw off the false worship of "Mathematical Diagrams". To liberate the imagination from "The Gods of Greece & Egypt" the poet must be a new Moses: "Israel deliverd from Egypt is Art deliverd from Nature & Imitation." As Essick has noted, "this deliverance must also lead away from a language based on an imitation of nature."¹¹ What is called for is a language of verbal and visual signs that communicate directly through the imagination. The model for such a sign-system already exists in the Bible. In praising "The Old & New Testaments" as "the Great Code of Art" (*Laocoön*), Blake affirms that its precepts of vision are immediately accessible. It is an inspired code of revelation, not a secret code to be deciphered by a privileged priesthood. Nevertheless, the "Code of Art" must be actively engaged to be fully understood: "Without Unceasing Practise nothing can be done Practise is Art If you leave off you are Lost" (*Laocoön*).

Much like the eighteenth-century debate whether melody or harmony provided the essential basis of music,¹² the debate whether line or color had

11 Essick, 23.

primacy in painting is, as Morris Eaves has asserted, "at its most superficial [...] an argument about the audience". In documenting that argument, however, Eaves goes on to reveal why line won primacy over color "as an orthodox doctrine of the European academies of art", and why Blake, who could assert confidently that "Nature has no Outline" (The Ghost of Abel), also proclaims "That the more distinct, sharp, and wirey the bounding line, the more perfect the work of art" (Descriptive Catalogue, 63-4).13 It is crucial to understand that, for Blake, there is no contradiction in these two assertions. How could Blake affirm "Human Imagination" as "Divine Vision" (Milton, 32), celebrate the capacity "To see a World in a Grain of Sand" ("Auguries of Innocence"), vet uphold the academic doctrine of linearism? Blake's defense of the "bounding line" had little in common with linearism as taught in the Royal Academy. For Joshua Reynolds, James Barrie, and John Opie, the academic "line" was defined in terms of the laws of perspective, optical geometry, and the mathematics of extension.¹⁴ For Blake, the line was the creation of the imagination. The passage quoted above (from The Ghost of Abel) adds precisely this argument: "Nature has no Outline: but Imagination has."

Vision for Blake is a physical activity. Visual perception is not a passive response in which the eye receives a retinal image which then passes into the mind as *camera obscura*. Perception involves mind and body actively; mind and body together experience the visible world. The eye moves, following whatever motion it beholds, adjusting to distance, adapting to darkness. It moves, too, in well-practiced coordination with the movement of the hand. Reaching, touching, grasping become so inseparably a part of seeing that sensory awareness imaginatively complements the act of seeing. We see, that is, with our whole body, not just with our eyes.¹⁵ We see the hidden other side of things because we are accustomed to participating in and interacting with the world that we behold. Blake could assert that there are no lines in nature because he knew that he could hold his hand around an apple, walk through

Homers Poetry and On Virgil [...] suggests a later date." (The Complete Graphic Works of William Blake [New York: G. Putnam's Sons, 1978], 486)

¹² Jean-Jacques Rousseau: Dissertation sur la musique moderne (1743) and Lettre sur la musique française (1753), in Oeuvres complètes 13 vols., ed. Charles Lahure (Paris: Hachette, 1865).

¹³ Morris Eaves: William Blake's Theory of Art (Princeton: Princeton UP, 1982), 11-4; 18-38; see also: W.J.T. Mitchell: Blake's Composite Art: A Study of the Illuminated Poetry (Princeton: Princeton UP, 1978), 58-69.

¹⁴ Joshua Reynolds: Discourses, ed. Helen Zimmern (London: Walter Scott, 1887), 41-5 (Fourth Discourse); James Barrie, John Opie, and Henry Fuseli: Lectures on Painting, by the Royal Academicians, ed. Ralph N. Wornum (London: Bohn, 1848), 119; 249; Eaves, 14.

¹⁵ Mitchell, 34-5: "For Blake, in the final analysis the body and the imagination are separable principles only in a fallen world of limited perception, and the business of art is to dramatize their unification: "The Eternal Body of Man is The Imagination. [...] It Manifests itself in his Works of Art' (*Laocoön*)."

a doorway, wade across a watery shore. But to draw these things required the imaginative fiction of the "bounding line". The line translates into a two-dimensional sign the contour of an apple, a doorframe, a river's margin.

What sets Blake apart from the academicians is his insistence on the imagination as the source and province of the line. He knew, of course, that lines could be read as limits, but he also knew that the limits of opaqueness and contraction could open into translucence and expansion, and that the line inscribed by "ev'ry Bird that cuts the airy way" could open into "an immense world of delight". Precisely because it has been wrought by the imagination, the line invites an imaginative penetration of the limits which it presumes. The more precise the line, the more powerfully it engages the imagination (and *vice versa*). Lines may be fictive, Blake argues in the catalogue for his 1809 exhibit, but the very conditions of experience require lines to be drawn.

The great and golden rule of art, as well as of life, is this: That the more distinct, sharp, and wirey the bounding line, the more perfect the work of art. [...] The want of this determinate and bounding form evidences the want of idea in the artist's mind, and the pretence of the plagiary in all its branches. How do we distinguish the oak from the beech, the horse from the ox, but by the bounding outline? How do we distinguish one face or countenance from another, but by the bounding line and its infinite inflexions? What is it that builds a house and plants a garden, but the definite and determinate? What is it that distinguishes honesty from knavery, but the hard and wirey line of rectitude and certainty in the actions and intentions. Leave out this line and you leave out life itself; all is chaos again, and the line of the almighty must be drawn out upon it before man or beast can exist. (*Descriptive Catalogue* 63-4)

The importance to Blake of this doctrine of the line, in both its moral and aesthetic contexts, is that it gives vivid and reliable determination to the chaotic flux of experience. It is crucial to Blake's thinking, of course, that the line is participially active as a "bounding line" amidst "infinite inflexions". Nevertheless, the imagination fulfills itself not in a vague blurring, but only in the certain determination of the "minute particulars". "That is not a Line which Doubts & Hesitates in its course." Thus for Blake "Every Line is the Line of Beauty" and "only fumble & Bungle which cannot draw a Line [...] is Ugliness" (*Public Address*, 46). In one of his last pronouncements on his art, four months before his death, he thanked George Cumberland "for the Pains you have taken with Poor Job", and he went on to lament the scientific, and political, addiction to the indefinite and abstract which rendered unfashionable his own imaginative insistence on the definite line:

I know too well that a great majority of Englishmen are fond of The Indefinite which they Measure by Newtons Doctrine of the Fluxions of an Atom. A Thing that does not Exist. These are Politicians & think that Republican Art is Inimical to their Atom. For a Line or Lineament is not formed by Chance[:] a Line is a Line in its Minutest Subdivision[s:] Strait or Crooked It is Itself & Not Intermeasurable with or by any Thing Else Such is Job (12th April 1827)

As an engraver whose very medium requires incising lines upon a copper plate, Blake had good reason to be preoccupied with the precision and expression of the line. In insisting upon the line as the construct of the imagination, however, he left it to the eye of the beholder to move around within a depicted scene. The frames to his illustrations of Job do not "contain" scenes; rather, they function as windows through which a scene is beheld. When the messenger, in plate 4 [figure 7], has arrived into the scene from the left, he points back to the catastrophe which he has escaped as if, could we only peer around the edge of the frame, we might see the havoc and slaughter left by the marauding Sabeans. At the edge of the frame on the right, a grazing sheep has wandered partially into view. As Gombrich has reminded us, the fact that a two-dimensional painting may hide things from us relying on overlap to indicate depth, depicting incomplete figures to suggest an extension of space beyond the edge of the canvas was not always known to artists. Not until the Renaissance did artists begin to exploit the illusion of something around the corner of the frame. Albrecht Dürer deserves credit for his innovative experimentation in etching only "the tail end of a bull" in his print of The Prodigal Son.16 Although Blake frequently invites us to peer around the corner, his frames have a more complex liminal function. He not only prompts us to step through the frame and enter into the scene, he occasionally has the scene protrude through the frame (as in plates 13 and 16 [figures 17, 20], second state). Defiance of frames and borders had already been exploited in the baroque frescoes of Tiepolo,¹⁷ but not even in the emblematic and allegorical borders of Richard Bentley¹⁸ had an interaction between frame and picture been developed to the degree we witness in Blake's illustrations to The Book of Job.

The particular uses of framing in Romantic literature and art were probably motivated by the fascination with creative process and aesthetic experience. In the poetry, we find a variety of experiments with framing devices: the problematic interpretive frame that Coleridge provides with the marginal glosses to *The Rime of the Ancient Mariner*; the narrator's sceptical frame in

¹⁶ E. H. Gombrich: Art and Illusion: A Study in the Psychology of Pictorial Representation (Princeton: Princeton UP, 1960), 211-14.

¹⁷ A. Morassi: Giovanni Battista Tiepolo (1955).

¹⁸ Richard Bentley: Drawings of Mr. Bentley to Six Poems of Mr. T. Gray (1753), in the Wilmarthen S. Lewis Collection: Farmington, Connecticut.

the opening fifty and closing fifty lines of Shelley's *Alastor*; the dream-withindream movement of Keats's *Fall of Hyperion*; the circular structure of Blake's *The Mental Traveller* and the inside/outside and window/mirror illusions of his *Crystal Cabinet*. Among the framing devices in the graphic arts, the "open window", the "mirror", and the "picture-within-picture" pervade Romantic iconography. In the use of mediating frames, however, only Runge rivalled the achievement of Blake.

In "Der Morgen" (1803), the early ink sketch for a series of copper-plate engravings (*Die vier Tageszeiten*), the ascension in both picture and frame is accomplished in the floral symbols of the creative energy, kinetic and potential, in childhood. In sketches for a later version ("Aurora", 1806), Runge extended the symbolic vocabulary by introducing the figure of Aurora, thus giving assertive sexuality to the definition of the dawn of creative energy. Too, he combines the organic imagery with imagery of fire and light ("Morgen mit Aurora", 1807). The effect, when rendered in oil on canvas (*Der Kleine Morgen*, 1808) [figure 68], brilliantly consummates generative sexuality with the addition of the new-born babe.¹⁹ The soaring Aurora is engulfed in radiant light, but light which, although diffused in the circle of dancing cupids, is directed along a vertical axis, pointing above the lily to the morning star, yet seeming to emanate not from Aurora but from the babe. The babe, cradled in fertile vegetation, looks upward in beatific gesture to embrace the dawn.

To this scene of mythic dawn, Runge adds his mediating frame. What is revealed in the frame is that the source of light burns *within* the world of nature: the light radiating upward in the picture is merely focused or filtered through the babe. The vital light actually emanates from the subterranean panel of the frame. As in a full solar eclipse, the source of light is concealed from the viewer, who can only observe indirectly its power of illumination. The energy, which in the picture is made to ascend from babe to star in the ecstatic embrace of dawn, is passed through the frame by touch (like God's divine touch which gives life to Adam in Michelangelo's fresco). The image of the creative fire is transformed into the image of organic life and the metaphor is continued first as the creative pulse in the red lily of sensual passion, then in the white lily of spiritual love. The red and white lilies in the frame correspond, respectively, to the figure of Aurora and to the cupids surrounding the white lily in the picture. The light of the star radiates through

19 Jörg Traeger: Philipp Otto Runge und sein Werk: Monographie und kritischer Katalog (Munich: Prestel, 1975), Plates 265; 270; 275-6; 280A-283A; 280B-283B; 382-414; Color Plates 26; 165; 344-361; 417-433. the black funereal border, through the parting clouds in the upper frame, into a heavenly sphere of angel heads.

Framing, as narrative device, emerged no doubt early, if not congenitally, in primitive story-telling art, for even the simple repetition of word or image may work as a refrain to lend a sense of structure and cohesion.²⁰ By the time of Homer, frame-narrative had become a highly wrought technique. Consider, for example, the voyage of Telemachus as frame to the grander mythic adventure of Odysseus; the Nekyia narrative framed by the funeral of Elpenor, framed in turn by the thrall of Circe; the Thrinacian episode framed by the passage through Scylla and Charybdis; the entire backflash, from Cantos V through XII, on Odysseus's struggle to return framed by his captivity in the cave of Calypso.²¹ Such frames not only extend the seeming dimensions of time and space, each tale-within-tale also reverberates as artifice within art, so that illusion seems reality, and the mythic becomes historic. The effect, much as in Quince's production of "Pyramus and Thisby" in the court of Duke Theseus, or Hamlet with the players in the court of King Claudius, more than interprets and directs, it integrates and amplifies the action.22

Probably set down from oral tradition at the same time, at least within the margins of a century, as the Odyssey, The Book of Job reveals in its narrative structure a similar fascination with frames: the exterior frame is composed of the prologue and epilogue (chs. 1-2 and 42), wherein God first sanctions the trial of Job's faith and finally restores Job's fortune; the central debate on wisdom (chs. 4-28) is framed by Job's two soliloquies (chs. 3 and 29-31); the discourse of Elihu (chs. 32-7) is framed by Job's defiant challenge that God should appear to accuse him (ch. 31:35-7) and God's appearance in the whirlwind (chs. 38-41).²³

Blake's version of *The Book of Job*, although even more involved in framing, departs radically from the structure of the biblical version. In his use of mediating frames, Blake literally turns that structure inside out. For one thing, in the twenty-one plates of his narrative structure he has elaborately attended to some passages and efficiently condensed others; furthermore, he has interpolated freely, especially in the latter frames, where phrases from the gospel and the epistles intrude with increased frequency among the excerpts

²⁰ C. M. Bowra: Primitive Song (Cleveland and New York: World Publishing, 1962), 73-82.

²¹ Homer: The Odyssey trans. Richmond Lattimore (New York: Harper & Row, 1967).

²² Anthony B. Dawson: Indirections: Shakespeare and the Art of Illusion (Toronto: Toronto UP, 1978).

Edouard Dhorme: A Commentary on the Book of Job (Nashville: Thomas Nelson, 1984);
The Book of Job Commentary by Norman C. Habel (Cambridge: CUP, 1975).

of Hebraic wisdom and the narrative text of Job. The first seven plates, one-third of Blake's sequence, are devoted to details of chapters one and two; the last nine plates, almost half the sequence, depict God's answer from the whirlwind and the terms of Job's restoration from chapters thirty-eight to forty-two. What in the biblical version had been a framing prologue and epilogue, has been transformed here into a dominant narrative concern. Blake keeps the frame of Job's two soliloquies (Job 8, 11 [figures 11, 14]), but he contains, as far as the visual representation is concerned, the lengthy central debate of Bildad, Zophar, and Eliphaz, from chapters four through twentyeight, in the illustration of only two plates (Job 9, 10 [figures 12, 13]), and the six chapters of Elihu's discourse are visually represented in a single plate (Job 12 [figure 16]). This radical transformation in structure does not mean that Blake neglected, or even subordinated, the central wisdom debate of The Book of Job; the transformation reveals, rather, that Blake shifted narrative perspective in order to make the issues of wisdom not the central action but the interpretive frame for that action. The wisdom debate, as conducted in the frames, mediates the narrative events in Job's trial of torment.

Even with the title-page, Blake begins, modestly to be sure, a play of mediation. The verbal and visual elements within the frame interact not only in the clockwise flight of the seven angels (descending in the east and ascending in the west, counter to the solar course) in the deep of Job's dark night of trial, but also in the gothic lettering of the English title and the dominance, above the linear division, of the Hebrew title. The frame, heavily accentuated as a double rectangle within a larger double rectangle, sets *The Book of Job* aloft upon a cloud of material reason (the statement of legal conformance, given here within the cloud, is excluded from the frame in all twenty-one subsequent plates).

In the opening plate (Job 1 [figure 4]), Blake has made the frame a "tent of prosperity" pitched over a sacrificial pyre, which bears a motto implicating the opposition between verbal and visual mediation. The first phrase is selfdenying as literal referent: "The Letter Killeth." How are we to read such lethal letters? The second phrase adds a self-redeeming alternative: "The Spirit giveth Life." The third terms, however, provoke the grand problem of how word and image, and Life itself, are to be understood: "It is spiritually discerned." Before going on to apply this motto to an interpretation of the picture of Job and his family in the attitude of worshipping the letter (the two open books) or, perhaps, the spirit (Job's eyes are turned upward, possibly inward, as in the 1823 study for his head), it would be wise to appraise the double paradox of the motto. Not only has Blake thus framed Pauline wisdom in the very midst of the opening lines of the narrative (Job 1:1-2), he has deliberately contradicted Paul, for "The letter killeth, but the spirit giveth life" is a statement addressed to the Corinthians explaining the divine call as "ministers of the *new* testament" (2 Cor. 3:6), and the affirmation of spiritual discernment reverses Paul's statement on the ability of natural man to understand words of wisdom, "for they are foolishness unto him, and he cannot know them for they are spiritually discerned" (1 Cor. 2:14). Blake thus engages at the very outset the wisdom debate of the central chapters of *The Book of Job*, for his motto carries with it the argument of Paul that wisdom teaching is futile because God has "made foolish the wisdom of the world"; therefore, he preaches "not in persuasive words of wisdom, but in demonstration of the Spirit of power, that your faith should not stand in the wisdom of men, but in the power of God" (1 Cor. 2:4-5).

The motto of the sacrificial pyre, then, bears wisdom as inaccessible to Job as that of the books lying open before him. Spiritually uninformed, the close union of mutual love and trust in the worshipful attitude remains affectation and pretense. One should recall that the invocation of prayer in the words at the top of the frame, "Our Father which art in Heaven, Hallowed be thy Name," are taken from the section in the Sermon on the Mount where Christ cautions against false affectation and hypocrisy in prayer. In the 1806 watercolor-series, this text was inside the picture, symbolically inscribed in the sun which descends at the advent of Job's dark night of trial. In the sacrificial pyre at the bottom of the engraved plate, the flames blaze upward through the words: "Thus did Job continually." Blake has chosen these words to emphasize and expose Job's pernicious doubts, for they refer not only to the scene of worship in the illustration, but to the context, as well, from which they are drawn: Job "offered burnt offerings according to the number of them all: for Job said, It may be that my sons have sinned, and cursed God in their hearts. Thus did Job continually." (Job 1:5)

In the parallel plate with which Blake closes his narrative sequence (Job 21 [figure 25]), the same mediating details are repeated but with significant alteration. The caption here, "So the Lord blessed the latter end of Job more than the beginning", although it forces the recollection of the parallel opening plate, is not without irony in celebrating the blessing (Job 42:17), both in the biblical text, which is continued at the bottom of the frame, and in Blake's illustration. The motto on the sacrificial pyre, which is again taken from the epistle, now is made absolutely self-denying and is set in perfect opposition to the conditions of plate 1 [figure 4]. In the epistle addressed to the Hebrews, the letter of the law is challenged:

For the law having a shadow of good things to come, and not the very image of these things, can never with the same sacrifices which they offered year by year continually make the comers thereunto perfect. For then would they not have ceased to be offered? because that the worshippers once purged should have had no more conscience of sins. But in those sacrifices there is a remembrance again made of sins every year. For it is not possible that the blood of bulls and goats should take away sins. Wherefore when he [Christ] cometh into the world, he saith, Sacrifice and offering thou wouldest not, but a body hast thou prepared me: In burnt offerings and sacrifices for sin thou hast had not pleasure. (Hebrews 10:1-6)

Job's continual "burnt offerings" on the sacrificial pyre of the opening plate only aggravated and perpetuated sin; here in the concluding plate that sin is absolved. The flames are burning more brightly, but the dog is no longer holding the lamb before the fire; rather, the lambs have moved to the side and the dog slumbers as at a hearth. The dog must be considered here as an agent of stupidity, perpetuating sin; much in the same sense as bewailed by Enion: "'I have chose the serpent for a councellor & the dog/ For a schoolmaster to my children" (The Four Zoas, Night the Second, p. 35, 389-90). On close observation the face of the schoolmaster may be discovered peering forth from the hairy haunches of the dog. In the closing plate, only the dog remains untouched by redemption: he slumbers still, while even the sheep have raised their heads. The linear movement of upward rising is sustained in every detail. The sun that was first seen setting behind the gothic spires at the left, now arises on the right; the books of wisdom, letter and law, that weighed heavily on the laps of Job and his wife are replaced by the slim songster, the lyric scroll, and the lyre held by the three daughters. The instruments that formerly hung idle upon the tree are here lifted up in joyful harmony. This same motif of jubilation Blake had used to depict the hymn sung by Christ and the Apostles when, after the Last Supper, they arose to go out to the Mount of Olives (Mark 14:26).24 With the frame added to the engraved version, we see that upward linear movement sustained. The flames of the pyre are not stifled in sacrifices of covert sin, but blaze upward uninterrupted. The lines are not arrested by the horizontal planes, accentuated in the first plate by the open books and the legs of the kneeling figures, not inverted by the shepherd crooks that turned the vertical lines back upon the heads of Job's seven sons. All lines now continue in their ascent through the upright figures and their uplifted instruments, especially evident in the prominent verticality of Job's harp and that of his eldest son, and the upward gesture of Job's left hand above the beams of the rising sun.

In the frame, Job is restored to the "tent of prosperity"; the text from the close of *The Book of Job* at the bottom proclaims the generative perpetuation of the Lord's blessing of Job, and in the text soaring above the celebrant figures Blake has quoted from John's vision of the singers who have overcome the dragon beast: "And they sing the song of Moses, the servant of God, and the song of the lamb, saying: 'Great & Marvellous are thy Works Lord God Almighty, Just & True are thy Ways [O] thou King of Saints'" (Rev. 15:3). In the bottom corners of the frame, the ram and the bull have reversed positions: the bull (as the first house of the zodiacal calendar) takes ascendent position with the sun in the east, and the ram now controls the herding crook, the only shepherd's staff to remain, for those originally held by the seven sons have disappeared in the final plate.

The pyre blazing in plates one and twenty-one is seen as a consuming frame of fire surrounding the scenes of Job's torment in plates three and four. When hell gapes in the center illustration of plate 16, the frame becomes an encompassing inferno with burning text. The turning point, when the flames become the energy of "Eternal Delight" rather than consuming fires of damnation and eternal torment, is found in plate 18.

The pyre is brought in from the frame not as an altar of sacrificial offering to explate sin (as in plate 1 [figure 4]) but as a shrine of communion to participate in the creative energy (as in plate 21 [figure 25]). The flame from the pyre which arises from the frame and ascends with the upward movement of the central figures, integrating motto, caption, and surrounding text, at once interprets and informs the action that is kindled from the bottom of the frame.

The wisdom debate, both in The Book of Job and in Blake's illustrations, reaches its resolution in God's answer from the whirlwind. In an early inkand-watercolor version, "Job confessing his Presumption to God who answers from the Whirlwind" (c. 1800-1805), Blake sought to unravel the ontological mystery in terms of the Seven Spirits of God. He renders the whirlwind mythically as the clockwise spiral of the Seven Spirits out of the divine Godhead. In the plates of 1825, the Seven Spirits revolve, as we have seen, around the titlepage. In the representation of the Lord's answer (Job 13 [figure 17]), however, Blake gives us the paradox of stasis and flux in contrary terms: in the center illustration God hovers tranquilly in the very eye of the storm, which spirals clockwise in lines of dynamic energy. In the frame, God is represented in flux, a part of the movement and energy which he creates-an energy, as we see in the felled trees at the bottom of the frame, with a power destructive as well as creative. As is evident in the second state proof (from the Rosenwald Collection), plate 13 is one of the two plates in which Blake chose to break through the dividing borders.25 Swirling through the

²⁴ Compare "Hymn of Christ and the Apostles" (c. 1805) and Job 21 (watercolor, 1806); Butlin, Plates 546 and 717; Cat. 490 and 550-21.

frame, the whirlwind is manifest as one energy. The paradox of creative and destructive consequences is thus more emphatically demonstrated as a confusion resulting from man's pretenses to wisdom uninformed by knowledge. The caption, with the accompanying praise from Psalm 104, announces the turn in Job's perception, and the text following from the caption, beginning at the top and continuing at the bottom, gives God's challenge to the false presumption of wisdom:

> Then the Lord answered Job out of the whirlwind, and said: Who is this that darkeneth counsel By words without knowledge? (Job 38:1-2)

In order to speak wisdom, it is necessary first to have the knowledge attained through experience. This is the very distinction Blake drew between the Mental Traveller and the "cold Earth wanderers".

The cult of wisdom, represented in Eliphaz, Bildad, and Zophar, here crouching in fright beneath the whirlwind, recalls in the Hebraic Testament a tradition at once pragmatic and humanistic, much older than monotheism. The wisdom thinker derived his system from experience, distilling a set of axioms which, in terms of practical expedience, direct the relationship of man to the conditions of reality, be it personal, familial, social, or political. In the course of time, with the expansion of monotheism, wisdom thinking had to absorb into its tenets the essentially incompatible conditions of divine providence. The *Proverbs* and *Ecclesiastes* in the Old Testament, the *Ecclesiasticus* and the *Wisdom of Solomon* in the Apocrypha, are the principal survivors of the old tradition. Unfortunately, wisdom thinking lost in its transmission its original pragmatic base in experience and came to rely increasingly on the dogmatic appeal to the authority of the axioms and proverbs of wisdom.

The Book of Job narrates the conflict between wisdom and divine providence in the person of Job as he struggles to understand his trial of torment. The resolution comes in the Voice out of the Tempest. God's questioning forces Job to consider the possibility of discovering in natural process the vitality of divine process.

> Hath the rain a father? Or who has begotten the drops of dew? Out of whose womb came the ice? And the hoary frost of heaven, who hath gendered it? (Job 38:28-29)

If wisdom thinking represents the distillation of practical axioms out of pragmatic experience, then the wisdom of the divine must demand no less

than the full experience of divine creation. This turn of argument Blake has visually interpreted by adding interior frames to show the limits of man's wisdom inside of God's creation. In the early version of plate 14, from the watercolor series for Thomas Butts, Blake illustrates God's word from the whirlwind in the framed divisions that surround the central divinity. With his wife and three accusors ("Corporeal Friends are Spiritual Enemies" Milton 4:26), Job is embowled in an Ulro cave of physical constraint. Above the cloud barrier over the heads of Job and his wife, the sun pursues its nocturnal course westward to dawn in the east. Apollo, in Blake's myth, is associated with Los, the creative energy, the passion and imagination of man. In the cloud frame to the left is Diana, the moon goddess of the hunt and of chastity, a false virtue, as Blake defines it, of sexual hypocrisy. Diana is associated in Blake's myth with Vala, the cruel priestess, and with the Whore of Babylon in Revelations, who rides the many-headed dragon beast. Framed above God's outstretched arms are the stars of dawn, singing in the joy of creativity and ultimate resurrection. The four-fold division of man's being and his divine center relates, here, Blake's myth of the Four Zoas to Job's fallen condition.

In the engraved series, the four-fold center (*Job* 14 [figure 18]) is framed by the Genesis myth of the seven days of creation. The side panels of this frame are more elaborately detailed, because of the verbal-visual intricacy of frame-within-frame, than any other plate in this narrative sequence. The text at the top and bottom is taken from God's answer from the whirlwind, beginning with God's vigorous challenge to wisdom thinking, a challenge which explains the particular propriety of the chains from Genesis at each side. The voice in the whirlwind continues:

> Where wast thou when I laid the foundations of the earth? Declare, if thou hast understanding. Who determined the measures thereof, if thou knowest? Or who stretches the line upon it? Whereupon were the foundations thereof fastened? Or who laid the cornerstone thereof, When the morning stars sang together, And all the sons of God shouted for joy? (Job 38:4-7)

God's questioning of Job mocks the homely manner of the wisdom books, turning ironically his metaphors of parenthood, husbandry, house-building, travelling, and trade. At the same time, however, the questions lead Job into ever larger contexts in speculating the expanse of cosmic creation. In the frame here, just as in the "Proverbs of Hell" and the "Auguries of Innocence", Blake reveals how the power of wisdom thinking resides, not in perpetuating ancestral lore, but in provoking the individual mind. The words at the top of

²⁵ Bindman, Plates 638b (Job, 13) and 641c (Job, 16).

the frame, with the appropriate star-clusters left and right, continue in the biblical context to overwhelm the pupilarity of constrained thinking:

> Canst thou bind the cluster of the Pleiades, Or loose the bands of Orion? [.....]

Knowest thou the ordinances of the heavens? Canst thou establish the domain thereof in the earth? Canst thou lift up thy voice to the clouds, That abundance of waters may cover thee? Canst thou send forth lightnings, that they may go, And say unto thee, Here we are?

Who hath put wisdom in the inward parts? Or who hath given understanding to the mind? Who can number the clouds by wisdom? (Job 38:31-7)

God answers in questions not to obfuscate or avoid Job's charges, rather to direct thought to the origins of wisdom. From the homely terms of his opening queries God gradually expands his metaphorical reference to embrace the universe, "the ordinances of the heavens", but never abandoning the centrality of the individual mind in inquiring into the wisdom of the cosmos. The voice out of the whirlwind does not claim static omniscience but reveals, instead, a wisdom emerging from the confrontation between cosmos and chaos. The cogent conflict between the known and the unknown that compels man's wisdom differs in degree, not in kind from divine wisdom. Job's outcry of despair has directed the terms of God's reply.

In responding to Bildad, who began his discourse in an appeal to divine justice (Job 8:3) and to the wisdom of the ancient fathers (Job 8:8), Job had previously declared that divine justice never exonerates, but only condemns man. In his trial of life, Job says, man has no hope of debating with his punisher, for "God will not answer one question in a thousand" (Job 9:2-3). Job, however, is answered. Job had said that it was an awful God "who by himself spread out the heavens and trod on the sea-monsters back; who made Aldebaran and Orion, the Pleiades and the circle of the southern stars" (Job 9:8-9). God turns these images back upon Job in the commanding queries out of the whirlwind. Blake thus repeats these images in the top and bottom of the frame. Just as Enion, in her lament "What is the price of experience?" (The *Four Zoas*, 35:11), mourned the expense of grief and pain without pondering the value of what experience thus acquires, Job in his despair realized neither the potency of his own questions nor the futility of seeking an answer outside his own experience. God does not turn back his wrath; the partisans of Rahab lie prostrate at his feet. [... ...] Though I am right, I get no answer. (Job 9:13-15)

Job defines the "wisdom" of his God as incomprehensible to man, and his "might" as chaotic.

Wisdom and might are his. [.....] He makes counsellors behave like idiots and drives judges mad; [....] He uncovers mysteries deep in obscurity and into thick darkness he brings light. He takes away their wisdom from rulers of the nations and leaves them wandering in a pathless wilderness; they grope in darkness without light and are left to wander like a drunkard. (Job 12:13; 17; 22-5)

In the revelation depicted in plate 14 [figure 18], however, the conflict of chaos and cosmos, the churning Leviathan of the deep and the heavenly order of the stars on high are reconciled in the creative act, the six days of creation numbered in the clouds on each side of the frame.

The linking clouds provide a formal design not unlike the twining trees that frame the Piper's Introduction to the Songs of Innocence. When Blake begins the narrative of Job's trial (Job 2 [figure 5]), he frames the scene in a similar formal design. The twining trees become a Gothic window. Blake has divided into reflecting facets and mirror images the scene within. Job's God is his own image: both are surrounded by their families.²⁶ The accord is disrupted by the figure leaping in their midst. This figure, Satan before the throne of God, bears the features of Job's eldest son who sits at Job's back in the scene below. In the flames engulfing the eldest son, transformed as the Satanic adversary, are reflected the faces of Job and his wife. This play of reduplicated images persists even in the frame, for Job and his wife stand below in the idyllic confines of their self-deception. The dog that slumbers within the bench where Job has gathered his family is seen again within the gate in the frame below. The texts at the gate, above the fence and along the hedgerow, repeats the same juxtaposition of Job and his children with God and his Sons in the illustration. Within the Gothic frame are images of nesting, but they do not represent the joy of familial union, for they are

²⁶ John Beer argues "that both God and Job possess the same features" because "the heavenly scene exists simply to present the earthly one in its full visionary context." (*Blake's Visionary Universe* [Manchester: U of Manchester P; New York: Barnes & Noble, 1969], 269-73)

associated with the "peacock of pride" above Job's wife and "the parrot of vain repetitions" above the head of Job. The pillar of smoke and the pillar of fire are revealed within the twining branches in promise of a way out of the wilderness. The texts above expose the complications of the mirrored figures. "I beheld the Ancient of Days," is quoted from Daniel's dream, in which four terrible beasts arise from a stormy sea and the son of man appears from the clouds that stand before the throne of the Ancient of Days. "We shall awake up in thy Likeness" perverts the close of David's prayer for the protection against oppressors; he will be satisfied in material treasures and begetting in children the substance of self, rather than be satisfied in beholding the likeness of Jehovah. Blake has applied his references "I beheld" (Daniel 7:9), "We shall awake up" (Psalm 15:15), "I shall see God" (Job 19:26), "Hast thou considered my servant" (Job 1:8), "Thou art out Father" (Isaiah 64:8) all in commentary on Job's self-idealizing identity in godhead and his self-debasing identity in sexual generation. "The Angel of the Divine Presence" is manifest as satanic contradiction, and the Hebrew words, "Jehovah is King", pronounce the surrender to his tyranny.

The mirror-images of contradictory selfhood in the features of Satan and the eldest son are dramatically drawn in the scene of destruction (Job 3 [figure 6]). With the exception of plates 4 and 8 [figures 7, 11], nowhere else in the series of illustrations does the framing text follow the biblical source so forthrightly. From the court in heaven: "And the Lord said unto Satan, Behold, All that he hath is in thy Power" (Job 1:12); from the carousal: "Thy sons and thy daughters were eating and drinking wine in their eldest brothers house: And behold, there came a great wind from the wilderness, and smote the four corners of the house, and it fell upon the young men, and they are dead" (Job 1:18-19); and from the destruction of Job's flocks: "The fire of God is fallen from Heaven" (Job 1:16). Here is no eristic or sophistic play on wisdom, but simply the bald statement of disaster. Job's suspicion of the secret sins and blasphemies of his sons now rend asunder their household. The flames of guilt, recrimination, and self-inflicted torment, striking the eldest son in the wanton feast of degeneration, provide the principal visual motif of the frame: the fires burn upon the druidic altar; scorpions pose for the poisonous sting; the scaly coils of the serpent are revealed in the clouds of smoke. Although the text adheres strictly to its source, Blake has manipulated narrative time within the frame. The events of disaster in The Book of Job are framed by the statement that his "sons and daughters were eating and drinking wine in their eldest brother's house" (Job 1:13, 18). This verbal frame embraces the account of the four messengers who bring the reports of the fire falling upon the flocks and burning the servants, the Sabeans taking the oxen and slaying the servants, the Chaldeans taking the camels and slaying the servants, and finally the wind from the wilderness destroying the sons. Blake's use of the text accomplishes the same effect of the simultaneous onslaught: he has turned the narrative frame of the original to his own purpose, and he continues the temporal play in framing in the subsequent plate depicting the arrival of the messengers.

Again in plate 4 [figure 7] the framing text closely follows the biblical narrative. Blake has repeated the words "the fire of God is fallen from heaven" and has made it apply to the destruction of Job's family as well as his flocks and servants. Above, a sword-bearing, globe-striding Satan is seen, as he told God, "Going to & fro in Earth, and walking up and down it" (Job 1:7). Blake's use of the repeated refrain of the messengers, "And I only am escaped alone to tell thee" (Job 1:16, 17, 18, and 20), is stated but once, yet the repetition is visually cued to create the biblical effect of incremental crises. The temporal link in the narrative each messenger arrives while the previous messenger is still speaking Blake has effectively translated into visual representation. Framed within the legs of the first messenger and the Gothic church, come the subsequent sole survivors with their tales of woe to add to the anguish of Job.

The ornamental twining of the trees that formed the Gothic window of plate 2 [figure 5] is transformed in plate 5 [figure 8] with serpents, briars, and licking flames into an arch of torment. The text from *The Book of Job* is augmented in minute print with God's antediluvian despair:

Jehovah saw that the wickedness of man was great in the earth and that every imagination of the thoughts of his heart was only evil continually [...] and it grieved him at his heart. (Genesis 6:5-6)

The larger text, "Then Satan went forth from the Presence of the Lord," (Job 1:12 and 2:7) anticipates the second trial of torment which Blake has illustrated as immediately impending. The unobtrusive text from Genesis, however, calls attention to the source of Job's torment in his own mind. His God, as his own idealized selfhood, is still surrounded by his family with Satan bearing the features of the eldest son. Yet Job has deprived himself of family communion and now, in a scene of Blake's invention not directly from *The Book of Job*, breaks his bread with another image of self: a blind man led by a dog. The last line of the minute print, just above the serpent's eye, is quoted from the same Psalm that Blake used in praise of the divine energy asserted in the whirlwind (*Job* 13 [figure 17]):

> O Lord my God, thou art very great; Thou art clothed with honour and majesty. Who coverest thyself with light as with a garment:

Who stretchest out the heavens like a curtain: Who layeth the beams of his chambers in the waters: Who maketh the clouds his chariot: Who walketh upon the wings of the wind: Who maketh his angels spirits, his ministers a flaming fire. (Psalm 104:1-4)

Job has torment yet to suffer before he learns the power of the flaming fire, energy as eternal delight.

The son become Satan makes, in the next illustration (Job 6 [figure 9]), his last appearance until he returns in the redemption and reconciliation depicted in the final plate. This figure, although with a different face, had first appeared in the illustration of "Fire" from the *Gates of Paradise*. In the early version "For Children" (1793), the genitals were exposed and the eyes opened wide; in the later version "For the Sexes" (c. 1818), Fire still stands in the flames with outstretched arms bearing spear and shield, but his eyes are closed and his genitals, as Satan's here, scaled over. Even the cloth that covers Job's nakedness appears, as in Satan's words, "Skin for skin" (Job 2:4), marked with serpentine scales. The satanic son, his head in halo, the "arrows of the Almighty" (Job 6:4) in his right, the vial of agony in his left hand, assumes the posture of the crucifixion but the stigmata are suffered by the father, revealed in the uplifted palm.²⁷

In the mediating frame, at the upper corners, the angels that withstood the flames in the previous plate (*Job* 5 [figure 8]), now bear the bat wings of Satan "Going to & from in the Earth" (*Job* 4 [figure 7]) and from their hands drop the web-spinning spiders of the "godless man" whose "confidence shall break in sunder", as Bildad says, "And whose trust is a spider's web" (Job 8:13-14). Framed within the clouds above, one bat-winged figure soars in indulgent sport and the other sit upon the clouds and waves us welcome. Just as Jacob, when he sees Joseph's coat and presumes his son devoured by an evil beast, "rent his garment and put sackcloth upon his loins" (Genesis 37:34), so Job arose upon hearing of the death of his sons and daughters "and rent his robe, and shaved his head, and fell down upon the ground" (Job 1:20). His words appear in the clouds: "Naked came I out of my mother's womb, and naked shall I return thither: the Lord gave, and the Lord hath taken away; blessed be the name of the Lord" (Job 1:21). Blake has chosen not to shave Job's head, but he is true to the text in the central detail at the bottom of the frame:

27 In the late version for Thomas Butts (Job, 6 tempera c. 1826), Blake has given Satan the bat-wings that appear only in the frame of the engraved version, and he has taken way the malicious grin. Butlin, Plate 972, Cat. 807. So Satan went forth from the presence of the Lord, and smote Job with sore boils from the sole of his feet to the crown [of his head], And he took him a potsherd to scrape himself therewith. (Job 2:7-8)

The broken pot is set among other telling details: druidic stones, like those surrounding the suffering Job in the center; the shepherd's crook is broken; the locust has come into the land; the frog creeps forth from the bog where thistles, nettles, and ilex grow.

With the arrival of Job's comforters in the next plate (*Job* 7 [figure 10]), Blake recommences his ironic play with the wisdom debate in the mediating frame. The ironic paradox is evident in the figures of Job and his wife, as in plate 2 [figure 5], again in the frame and still in their pastoral state of ignorance: their eyes are closed, and schooled by the dog is Job's wife, who in the center illustration has just urged Satan's wager with her counsel to Job, "Curse God, and die" (Job 2:9). The text at the top of the frame gives Job's pious response (Job 2:10). The text at the bottom announces the coming of the "corporeal friends" (Job 2:12). And in the diminished print upon the pastoral glade, Blake has taken his text from the Epistle of James: "Ye have heard of the patience of Job, and have seen the end of the Lord" (James 5:11). The irony is patent only if we know the purport of James's letter:

For in many things we all stumble. If any stumbleth not in word, the same is a perfect man, able to bridle the whole body also. [...] the tongue is a fire: the world of iniquity among our members is the tongue, which defileth the whole body. [...] Therewith bless we the Lord and Father; and therewith curse we men, who are made after the likeness of God: out of the same mouth cometh forth blessing and cursing. [...] Who is wise and understanding among you? let him show by his good life his works in meekness of wisdom. (James 3:2-13)

James warns against zealous teaching, vain wisdom-saying and scripturespeaking. It is Job's *patience* he praises, not his lamentations and accusations before his three comforters.

As we have already seen, the wisdom debate with Bildad, Zophar, and Eliphaz is framed in *The Book of Job* by the two soliloquies of lamentation and accusation (Job 3 and 29-31). In Blake's illustration of the first soliloquy (*Job* 8 [figure 11]), the movement is tripartite, both in the illustration and in the frame. In the former, the vertical depth is defined by clouds, mountains, and human figures before the druidic stones. The horizontal dimensions are divided by the down-bowed wife beneath the volcanic mountain, the three friends beneath the druidic arch, and Job centered as the only figure with arms upraised breaking the line of the horizon. The framing text is also tripartite: Job's acceptance of the solitary night of estrangement (Job 3:7); his denunciation of his own birth and life (Job 3:3); and the statement of the seven days

Burwick: Blake's Laocoön and Job

of silent mourning (Job 2:13). Sky, cloud, and vegetation divide the frame; the vegetation consists of briar, thistle, and toadstool. In spite of the tripartite division, within and without, the frame insists upon harmony: the clouds billow above as an encompassing arch and precipitate below as nourishing rain.

The vision of Eliphaz (Job 9 [figure 12]) is used by Blake to reveal the problematic crux in all declarations of wisdom. Thus Blake has complicated the frame with deliberate trespassing of its boundaries. The incomplete arch within is completed as a circle in the frame. Eliphaz, in the story-teller's gesture, lifts his arm from the dimension of the present into the clouds framing his dream, a movement repeated in the exterior frame by the barren trees penetrating the clouds. In the central illustration, in which we recognize shapes from the engraving, "Fear and Hope are Vision" (*Gates of Paradise*, 13), the figure of Eliphaz appears redundantly as the story-teller, the fright-ened dreamer, and the chastizing God. Job attends only to the apparition of Eliphaz's God. The text of the cloud circle defines the cycle of the tale: man ascending to his zenith in God, descending to the state of angels and saints, and falling to his nadir in folly.

In plate 10 [figure 13] Blake has depicted "the Just Upright Man [...] laughed to scorn" (Job 12:4) in terms of the contraries of wisdom and folly. The accusations by his friends, on the right, and the doubt of his wife, on the left, contain and constrain Job in his plea of innocence. The paradox of "slay" and "trust" in the text above (Job 13:10-15) is continued in the life-death opposition in the text below (Job 14:1-3). The theme of wisdom and folly, which Blake knew from the wisdom-books of *Ecclesiastes* and *Proverbs* and had adapted to his own ends in the proverbs of *The Marriage of Heaven and Hell*, has taken form in framing corners as the cuckoo and the owl. The Roman arch ascends above the upper frame; the angels of lamentation are caught in chains above; bat wings protrude below; and in their talons the foolish bird clutches the serpent and the wise bird clutches the mouse. Illustration and frame reverberate with contraries, yet, as Blake insisted, "Without Contraries is no progression." Most telling of the visual details is the lonely, almost lost, blossom framed by the limbs of Job and his accusers.

Blake's accusers redouble in their two-armed gesture the condemnation of Macbeth in Fuseli's painting of *The Three Witches* (1783). Although Blake most likely knew, as well, David's *Oath of the Horatii (Serment des Horaces*, 1784), it is clearly Fuseli's composition which has influenced Blake. His rendition in 1793 of the scene, "What is man that at every moment you should try him?" (Job 7:17-8), in spite of its minute delineation, articulation, and extensive burin work, is less dramatic, not simply because the vigorous gesture is wanting, but also because accusation and doubt are aligned and the despairing Job is pushed from the center. Blake's interpretation of *Job* in 1793 was concerned primarily with the self overwhelmed in guilt and grief as opposed to the self overcoming grief through vision. His earlier concern is also evident in the companion plate, "I take away from thee" (1794), in which Ezekiel at the bedside of his dead wife accepts without protest God's trial:

Son of man, behold, I take away from thee the desire of thine eyes with a stroke: yet neither shalt thou mourn or weep, neither shall thy tears run down. (Ezekiel 24:16)

Blake has reversed Job at the right, Ezekiel at the left, the positions in the companion plates on grief. Job's tears and the lightning blast above his wife's head are contrasted with the visionary calm of Ezekiel, the halo that crowns his head, and the light that radiates above the dead wife. The import of these plates was to stress the value of divine vision over purely material perception, the "desire of thine eyes". Blake's later interpretation in the illustrations to *The Book of Job* does not depart from that stand, but he does come to emphasize more, as he did in the intervening prophetic works, the intense physical involvement in vision.

Unlike Eliphaz, who conjures vision as a story-teller, Job becomes completely enveloped in visceral vision (Job 11 [figure 14]). Eliphaz as dreamer was shown upon his bed with his hair standing out in fright before a God of his own image. Here, Job's God, mirror of himself, has his hair standing out in explosive rays. Before, the eldest son had been Job's Satan. Now, Job's Self-God is seen as Satan, cloven-hoofed and bound by the serpent. His right hand points to the stones of law, his left to damnation. Chained and scaly devils amid the flames reach up to clutch the legs and loins of the afrighted dreamer. This engraving inverts all aspects of the relationship between God and man as depicted in Blake's "God creating Adam" (1795). God with wings of brass before the radiant sun molds clay with his left hand, inspires the mind of man with his right. Man is born into the guilt of experience with the serpent coiling around his legs and loins, while the waters of materialism wash upon his bed of kindred clay. The nightmare vision of Job in plate 11 is no less a vision of creation. In this vision, however, Job recognizes the image of a tormenting God which he himself has created. The framing text, the second most heavily annotated in the series, traces the swirling fires of Job's thoughts: from his physical sufferings ("My bones are pierced [...] My skin is black" Job 30:17, 30), to the echo of Zophar's accusation of Job ("the triumphing of the wicked [...] the joy of the hypocrite" Job 20:5), to the redemption made possible by the discovery of self in God and Satan ("Satan himself is transformed into an Angel of Light" 2 Cor. 11:14-5). In the frame below, the caption, "With Dreams upon my bed" (Job 7:13-4), is followed by

148

149

Job's call that his word be "printed in a book [...] graven with an iron pen" that he may then repudiate mortal flesh and sustain his own individual vision and see with his own eyes his God (Job 19:22-7). Blake has added to this text his own words, swept up with flames: "tho consumed be my wrought Image." And continuing the ironic commentary, he adds the words of Paul "not to be shaken in the mind [...] by spirit, nor by word, nor by letter", nor be perceived by "the son of perdition, who opposeth and exalteth himself above all that is called God or is worshipped" (2 Thess. 2:2-4).

Blake has rendered this nightmare vision as the turning point in Job's plight. His recognition of self in God and Satan must be followed, in terms of the mediating message at the bottom of the frame, by overcoming the awful hold of selfhood, selfish constraint, and fear of death. Blake represents vision vs. constraint in his illustration of Elihu entering the wisdom debate (Job 12 [figure 15]). Elihu steps forward on his left foot, the pie firme, and with his left hand points to the source of his vision in the stars. Eliphaz, the story-teller, had pointed with his right hand into the clouds. Note that above the head of Eliphaz a solitary star is framed by the druidic stones. Elihu is portrayed, like Rintrah, as the just and angry man. Elihu is angry with Job "because he justified himself rather than God" (Job 32:2) and with the three friends "because they found no answer, and yet had condemned Job" (Job 32:3). Elihu has weighed the wisdom of experience and authority, and found it wanting. Whereupon he declares the providence of wisdom not culled from many years, but given in the inspiration of the moment. Blake has taken the caption from Elihu's first statement:

I am young, and ye are very old; wherefore I was afraid, and durst not shew you mine opinion. I said, Days should speak, and multitude of years should teach wisdom. But there is a spirit in man: and the inspiration of the Almighty giveth them understanding. It is not the old that are wise, nor the aged that understand what is right. (Job 32:6-9)

These are the most resounding words to be voiced by a mere mortal in the wisdom debate: not authority nor experience but inspiration is the source of wisdom. The proverbs of Elihu are made in Blake's frame to excite Job's inspiration. Job is shown in the center in rapt attention, grief gone from his face, and in the frame he lies in visionary dream. Elihu's words are printed in the ground beneath his head, upon his body and above it, and they are swept aloft with the naked dancers of inspiration to appear in the clouds and among the stars above.

The wisdom of inspiration in Elihu's message leads directly in Blake's illustrations to Job's most powerful vision (Job 13 [figure 16]), the appearance of God in the whirlwind, and God's revelation, as Blake interprets it, of

the creative contraries. In plate 14 [figure 17], Job, his wife and friends, look up from the cave of clouds into the universal act of creation. And in plate 15 [figure 18], they look down into the mundane egg to witness the struggle within their own world. With the exception of the gravelike enclosure of the nightmare vision plate, in these two plates Blake for the first time depicts Job in interior confines. Since taken from the spreading oak, Job has been seen on the hillside, among druidic ruins, exposed to the dark night. Here in the cave of clouds shelter is restored, but of God's making, not man's. The enclosed space imposes division in the very moment of revelation. God's left hand points down into the earth below the kneeling company. The frame repeats the theme of contraries: at the upper corners angels record the divine law of opposition; the lower corners are set in the wings of preying eagles. Written in the clouds at the top and left of the frame are the words of Elihu: "Can any understand the spreadings of the clouds, the noise of his tabernacle" (Job 36:29); "Also by watering he wearieth the thick cloud: he scattereth the bright cloud. Also it is turned by his counsels" (Job 37:11-2). Elihu's argument of inspired wisdom has challenged Job to perceive the movement and interaction of divine power and the vital sources of existence. In the right frame appear two of the forty-four divine proclamations on Behemoth and Leviathan: "Of Behemoth he saith, He is the chief of the ways of God" (Job 40:19); "Of Leviathan he saith, He is King over all the Children of Pride" (Job 41:34). In the lower frame, we see the watery shore, just as in "God creating Adam", and the shells of mortal life.

Framed in burning flames (Job 16 [figure 19]), in the center illustration, fall the three wicked errors: Job's false image of his son, along with his wife to the left, false image of his desire, and himself to the right, as false image of his own Satan-God. These three figures in the flame, a repetition of the dancing satanic son with the hovering faces of Job and his wife beneath his outstretched arms in the flames of plate 2 [figure 5], are here inverted and expelled; with the toppled satanic dancer, the former Job and his wife, faces hidden in shame, tumble into the abyss. Between the new Job and frightened accusers, the earth gapes to receive the errors of the past. In the mediating frame, Blake quotes from the New Testament to close the case against the accusations of the wisdom-thinkers. Written on water are the words of Paul that "God has chosen the foolish things of the world to confound the wise" (1 Cor. 1:27). Written in the flames immediately above the wave are Luke's words on Jesus and the fall of Satan (Luke 10:17-18). Written in the clouds to the left, are John's words describing the defeat of Satan, "The Accuser [...] is cast down" (Rev. 12:10). The caption, "Thou has fulfilled the Judgement of the wicked" (Job 36:17), is again Elihu's words, taken from his exhortation to

Burwick: Blake's Laocoön and Job

Job to avoid temptation and not barter the wealth of experience, even in hardship, for material prosperity and pleasures. The remaining texts echo the now vanguished accusations of the wisdom debate (Job 11:7-8; 12:31; 26:6).

With Job's redemption the wisdom debate is resolved (Job 17 [figure 20]). Nevertheless, no plate in the series is more filled with text. Indeed, the framing device of book-within-book, with the angel of mercy, quill in hand, in the very act of writing upon the scroll, calls us to give special consideration to wisdom in inspiration vs. wisdom in the written word, the dilemma of the opening plate: "The letter killeth, the spirit giveth life" (2 Cor. 3:6). Blake has simply repeated, in the two books and the central scroll, the answer Jesus gave to the Apostles when they wanted a vision of the divine Father. Jesus proclaims the union of Father and Son, truth and word, known through love and faith (John 14:7-28). Blake also cites the epistles and the Psalms to announce the redemption through revelation, and in Job's own words: "I have heard thee with the hearing of the ear but now my eye seeth thee" (Job 42:5). Although Lessing insisted on an essential difference between verbal and visual art, for Blake that difference is only circumstantial because both begin in imagination and end in vision.

When he again depicts Job in the ritual of worship (Job 18 [figure 21]), Blake emphasizes that "the Lord accepted Job" and that "my Servant Job shall pray for you" (Job 42:8-9). The double border remains intact, but the flame seems to pass behind it and enter into the circle of divine light which is continued in the frame. Job at his altar of praise revives the dead letter with the living spirit. Plate 1 gave us the book in the central illustration and the altar of the dead letter in the frame. Here the symbols and the circumstance are reversed. The altar of the living spirit is in the central illustration, and in the frame the book-within-book is opened to the Sermon on the Mount with Christ's commandment of love in the opposition of Good and Evil (Matthew 5:44-5; 48).

The floral richness of the plate depicting Job's return to the community (Job 19 [figure 22]) repeats the theme of abundant harvest in the standing wheat of the frame and the fruiting fig in the central illustration. The frame celebrates fertile abundance with triumphant palms, ascending and soaring angels above, angels scattering fruit and flowers below, roses of physical love and lilies of spiritual love garlanding the earth. In contrast to plate 5 [figure 8], where giving to the poor remains a selfish act (the recipient is a mirror-image of Job),²⁸ in plate 19 [figure 22] he accepts in the spirit of true *caritas*, with

the humble opening up of his heart, the offerings of his neighbors. This motif is enhanced by a seeming reciprocity between picture and frame: the picture itself seems to open up as the angels of charity, in the frame at each side, pass through the double border (elsewhere unbroken, except in the revisions to plates 13 and 16 [figures 16, 19]) as if to enter into the scene love and mercy.

Blake's varied play with framing techniques, as I have thus far attempted to demonstrate, are a distinctive part of his work. At the same time, of course, the concern with framing became prominent in the iconography of the Romantic period. As we have remarked in the framing techniques of Runge, and as we may witness again in the works of Friedrich, frames define the perspective of the observer and direct his access to the aesthetic experience within. In such a painting as Woman at the Window (Frau am Fenster, 1822 [figure 56]), we have little more than the frame and the observer. What is to be seen beyond the window, we can only guess at. The hints are few, and we can only imagine what is outside the room from the evocation of a passing mast and a row of poplars on the farther shore (we see neither the boat nor the river), or what is inside the room (behind our backs, as it were) from the tray of bottles on the window ledge. The frame provided in Friedrich's Entrance to the Cemetery (Friedhofseingang, 1825) invites us into a scene of life, with glade and trees; of death, with tombstones; and time, marked by the old Germanic stone protruding in the midst. Again, our access to this scene is mediated by observers: two small, dark figures who peer, cautiously, around the corner of the massive gate.29

The window or door offers a familiar liminal experience of passage and discovery. The reflecting mirror functions as the eye of an alter-ego who allows us to look around "inside" the painting.³⁰ Fuseli, too, made effective use of windows, mirrors, and frames to engage the participation of the viewer, to extend the dimensions of reality, and to provide a threshold between the natural and supernatural worlds. In his *Succubus* (1793) his nightmare visitor to the drowsy women leaps through a window into an unknown world

²⁸ Wright argues that Job's "giving half a loaf with his left hand to a poor man" in plate 5 is "a material rather than a spiritual gesture, as the left hand indicates" (19). Wright's verdict is

correct, but his reasoning is spurious. Blake does often use the left hand to indicate sinister motives. The problem with raising that suspicion here is that in plate 19, which for Wright represents "the real meaning of charity", the gift is again given with the left hand.

²⁹ Helmut Börsch-Supan and Karl Wilhelm Jähnig: Caspar David Friedrich: Gemälde, Druckgraphik und bildmäßige Zeichnungen (Munich: Prestel, 1973), Plates 335; 293; 400; 375-6.

³⁰ Maurice Merleau-Ponty: L'Oeil et l'Esprit (Paris: Gallimard, 1964), 16-7; 32-4; see also: Lorenz Eitner: "The Open Window and the Storm-Tossed Boat: An Essay in the Iconography of Romanticism." In: The Art Bulletin XXXVII (December 1955): 281-90; Adele M. Holcomb: "The Bridge in the Middle Distance: Symbolic Elements in Romantic Landscape." In: Art Quarterly XXXVII (1974): 31-58.

beyond. Fuseli played many variations on this theme of the nightmare incubus and succubus, and this one shares the sense of guilty intrigue which seem to haunt the other versions as well. Fuseli provokes a sense of forbidden sexuality with the ambiguities of waking and sleeping, the twilight mystery of the demonic horseman in monk's robes leaping through the window frame.³¹

As we know from the early version for Thomas Butts (Job 20; watercolor, 1806), the scene of Job's restoration with his three daughters also meant a restoration of creative energy, for the daughters are depicted as muses of painting, poetry, and music. The original conception also provides as setting, as most plates in the series, an exterior space. Not since the scene with the house of the eldest son, where the walls tumble upon the carousing children of Job, has Blake taken us into the interior space of a man-made dwelling. Enclosed space and human architecture are crucial to his final conception of the restoration (Job 20 [figure 23]). This plate, with the only such interior scene in the sequence, illustrates not only restored domestic shelter but also man's building and his arts as recreation of divine energy. For frame-withinframe, picture-within-picture complexity, no illustration in Blake's series can rival this scene of restored energy. Job, his arms outstretched in cruciform position, is seen retelling the narrative of his trial and redemption, a tale which Blake also retells in the framed pictures upon the walls. Job's right hand points to the destruction of his family unity in the "fire that fell from heaven". His left hand points to the destruction of his servants, fields, and material prosperity. And the picture-within-picture above Job's head repeats the Voice out of the Whirlwind, with Job's new understanding of God, mirroring the cruciform gesture of Job in the scene below. The text in the frame asserts the ubiquitous presence of God: "If I ascend up into Heaven thou art there. If I make my bed in Hell, behold, thou art there" (Psalm 139:8). Blake reminds us of Job's nightmare vision and his redemption, but he also asserts that Romantic primacy of mind which elaborates Heaven and Hell as mental states.32

Job has found his way to exalt love and inspire wisdom, and his latter end is more blessed than the beginning. The details of this final frame (Job 21 [figure 24]) we have already studied in comparison with the first frame in the narrative. What can be said now, in summary, applies to all we have seen in Blake's mediating techniques. The frame contains the textual narrative and commentary. What it means depends on how it is placed: the text of *Job* juxtaposed with other passages from the Old and New Testament, set above or below, printed large or small; in earth, air, fire, or water; in wind, wave, or cloud; upon altar, pyre, or druidic rock; in book, scroll, or among twining vines. In mediating the central illustration through the textual frame, Blake also achieves effective contrast with his pristine linear means. The flat surface of his thinly scored design and stark line figures surround, as a decorative window-frame, the scene of finely shaded depths: the varied striations affecting light and darkness, the rounded flesh and moulded physicality, the sweeping robes, all detailed in the controlled cross-hatching of Blake's intricate burin work. With the added subtleties of book-within-book, picture-within-picture, frame-within-frame, and the interplay of mirrored and reduplicated images, Blake has heightened the dramatic illusion throughout his narrative sequence and made his mediating frame the threshold to his particular vision of Job's fall into selfish constraint and ultimate rise into inspired wisdom.



³¹ Gert Schiff: Johann Heinrich Füßli: Oeuvrekatalog (Munich and Zurich: Schweizerisches Inst. für Kunstwissenschaft, 1972), Kat. 929; cf. Kat. 1445 (pencil and aquarelle, 1810).

³² Peter L. Thorslev, Jr.: "The Romantic Mind Is Its Own Place." In: Comparative Literature XV/3 (Summer 1963): 250-68.